

EXHIBIT A

1 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO

3 ~~~~~
4

5 JOSEPH BOND AND NICOLE THOMPSON, Individually
6 and on Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated,

Plaintiffs,

7
8 v. Case No. 1:20-cv-00677-PAB

9
10 LIGHTHOUSE INSURANCE GROUP, LLC, a Florida
11 Limited Liability Company,

Defendant.

12 ~~~~~
13

14
15 Remote 30(b)(6) Deposition of
16 LIGHTHOUSE INSURANCE GROUP, LLC, by JASON FARRO
17

July 8, 2021

18 11:02 a.m.
19

20
21 Witness Location:

22 6100 Rockside Woods Boulevard North
23 Suite 310
24 Independence, Ohio

25 Stephen J. DeBacco, RPR

Page 1

1 APPEARANCES:

2
3 On behalf of the Plaintiffs, via Zoom:

4 Peluso Law Firm, by

PATRICK H. PELUSO, ESQ.

5 3900 East Mexico Avenue, Suite 300

Denver, Colorado 80210

6 (970) 673-9075

ppeluso@pelusolawfirm.com

7
8 On behalf of the Defendant, via Zoom:

9 Brennan, Manna & Diamond, by

10 CHRISTOPHER B. CONGENI, ESQ.

75 East Market Street

11 Akron, Ohio 44308

(330) 253-5060

12 cbcongeni@bmdllc.com

13 ~ ~ ~ ~ ~

1 ordinary meaning of these terms, right?

2 Random would be -- I don't know --
3 it could pull a list of numbers that are 7, 17,
4 97, 5,063, right? That would be equipment that
5 randomly generates numbers. You following me?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Okay. And then a sequential number
8 generator would be equipment that just 1, 2, 3,
9 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, generates numbers in sequential
10 order. Does that make sense?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. So what I'm wondering is whether
13 those processes are used by the dialer that
14 Lighthouse has, which I believe is a
15 Vicidial --

16 A. Correct.

17 Q. -- to store the telephone numbers.

18 A. So when -- when a lead comes in, a
19 new lead comes into the system, that is going
20 to be the most recent lead that is stored. So
21 it is -- the last one into the system is always
22 going to be the first one dialed, if you follow
23 me.

24 Q. Okay.

25 A. All right. So if a lead came in

1 page, should really just be "yes"?

2 A. No. Again, I -- from -- when I
3 read this, it talks about us dialing the leads
4 in a random or sequential way in which --
5 that's how I read this question. Not the
6 storage of the leads, but of how we dialed the
7 leads.

8 Q. Okay. But if -- maybe if I had
9 worded the question or used a comma in here and
10 made it a little bit more clear that I was
11 asking about whether the dialing equipment has
12 the capacity to store telephone numbers using a
13 random number generator, would you agree that
14 that would be yes, because as we've
15 established, there's a lead ID number that's
16 randomly generated and assigned?

17 A. That is correct.

18 Q. Okay. So that's a yes, right?

19 A. Yes for the storage; no for dialing
20 of the numbers.

21 Q. Okay. So yes that a random number
22 generator is used to store the telephone
23 numbers?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Okay.

1 A. A random lead ID is assigned to
2 each lead that comes into the system.

3 Q. All right. Understood. Okay.
4 Thank you for -- for going through that with
5 me.

6 Just give me one minute to see if
7 there's any other questions I have on this
8 particular document.

9 Just real quick. This will be a
10 quick one. Can you scroll down to page 4 of
11 this document?

12 A. Yes, I'm there.

13 Q. Okay. And then Request to Admit
14 No. 5, it says you placed the calls to
15 Plaintiffs. Very simple response, isn't it?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. I'm just wondering if Lighthouse
18 sort of internally places all of the calls that
19 would be related to this case, or are there
20 some cases where a third-party call center may
21 have been used?

22 A. No. We do not use any third party.

23 Q. Okay. Easy enough. Okay.

24 The next one here says Request to
25 Admit No. 6, "You do not possess screenshots of

1 how any supposed Consent Language was presented
2 to Plaintiffs."

3 The response says, "Defendant
4 objects to this Request as vague as to the
5 extent that it seeks documents in the custody
6 or control of Plaintiffs or third parties.
7 Without waiving said objections, Defendant
8 states that Plaintiffs did give written consent
9 to be contacted by Defendant, and that
10 Defendant is in possession of and has produced
11 documentation of the consent language agreed to
12 by Plaintiffs."

13 We'll go through some of those
14 documents later -- later today, but I think
15 there -- I think what you're referring to there
16 are e-mails of folks at -- at your company
17 with -- people with these lead generators where
18 they sort of copy and pasted what they say the
19 consent language was, which doesn't quite
20 answer my question about whether there's
21 screenshots of what the website would have
22 looked like.

23 Do you know if Lighthouse has
24 screenshots or other documents that would
25 evidence how that consent language would have

1 appeared on a website if a person, you know,
2 did go there and fill out their information?

3 A. We do not have that information.

4 Q. Okay. Do you know if you guys
5 asked for it and the lead generators just don't
6 have it?

7 A. I don't know that question. I
8 don't know that -- what we asked for was the
9 consent language, and this is what they
10 provided us, is --

11 Q. Okay.

12 A. -- what we shared.

13 Q. Okay. So you don't know if you've
14 asked for documents that would evidence, you
15 know, how that consent language would have been
16 presented, you know, sort of in context?

17 When you look at consent language,
18 to me, it's out of context. You don't know how
19 it would have appeared on the website, what it
20 would have looked like. You don't know if you
21 asked for screenshots or other documents that
22 would show that?

23 A. I just know that we asked for the
24 consent language, and which they provided us
25 with that information, and which we shared with

1 you.

2 Q. Okay. All right. Okay.

3 All right. Jumping down to the
4 next one, Request to Admit No. 7, it says, "You
5 called at least 40 other persons using the same
6 equipment used to call Plaintiffs for the same
7 purpose You called Plaintiffs where you
8 obtained supposed prior express consent to call
9 and/or text in the same manner as You claimed
10 you obtained prior express consent to call
11 Plaintiffs."

12 And the response says, "Defendant
13 objects to this Request as vague to the extent
14 that it does not define the term 'same
15 purpose.' Without waiving said objections,
16 Defendant states it has called at least 40
17 other persons with prior express consent using
18 the same equipment with which Defendant made
19 calls to Plaintiff."

20 So I want to kind of break this
21 out. And this is another one where there's
22 kind of, you know, three or four different
23 components to the question, which, you know, I
24 understand can be, you know, a little difficult
25 to respond to at times.

1 So let's just start with this
2 objection that we didn't define "same purpose."

3 You know, I'm not trying to trip
4 you up here. I'm really just using those words
5 as, you know, common usage, right?

6 Lighthouse called my clients to
7 sell them insurance products, right?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. So the same purpose would just be
10 other persons called to solicit the sale of
11 insurance products.

12 A. We do not just randomly call
13 individuals. People consent to be called when
14 we purchase that lead, and we have agreements
15 with the lead vendors, and they request to be
16 contacted by an agent to sell insurance
17 products.

18 Q. Right. I understand that you're
19 not randomly dialing people, right? We
20 established that earlier. You're buying leads
21 and you're calling the leads.

22 But is it fair to say that every
23 time a Lighthouse employee or contractor,
24 call -- call personnel, you know, whoever is
25 sitting down and making these sales calls,

1 every time they call one of the leads, they're
2 calling to sell insurance products, right?
3 They're not calling for any other purpose?

4 A. That is correct.

5 Q. Okay. So then all the calls are
6 for the same purpose that my clients were
7 called. They were called to -- because
8 Lighthouse wanted to sell them insurance
9 products.

10 A. Yes, at their request.

11 Q. Right. Okay. So we're on the same
12 page. So that's -- you know, the term "same
13 purpose" was not defined, but it sounds like
14 we're on the same page, that the same purpose
15 was to solicit insurance products.

16 So then --

17 MR. CONGENI: Object to the
18 commentary.

19 Q. Do you disagree with what I said,
20 Jason? I'm sorry. I was just confirming that
21 we were on the same page.

22 A. It's not "solicit." Again, we are
23 asked by --

24 Q. Okay. Okay.

25 A. -- the individuals that are

1 obtaining [sic] to get a quote to be contacted
2 for insurance purposes.

3 Q. Okay. So you've used the word
4 "solicit" as more of a, you know, random
5 knock-on-the-door sort of thing. Okay.

6 A. Correct.

7 Q. Okay. So I won't use that word,
8 then.

9 So -- well, which word would you
10 choose? That they're calling to sell insurance
11 products?

12 A. We are -- again, we're calling
13 people who have opted in to be contacted
14 because they have requested information about
15 insurance products.

16 Q. Okay. But when you call, you're --
17 you're perhaps providing information about the
18 insurance products, but you're also hoping to
19 sell the insurance product?

20 A. That is correct.

21 Q. Okay. All right. Okay. So we're
22 on the same page on that part.

23 The next part of this response I
24 want to get clarity on is the portion where it
25 says, "Without waiving said objections,

1 A. Correct.

2 Q. Okay. Does Lighthouse use lead
3 generators other than those two?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Okay. So when I say, you know,
6 supposed prior express consent to call and/or
7 text in the same manner as you claim it was
8 obtained to call Plaintiffs, are you referring
9 to this consent that Lighthouse claims was
10 provided in the context of All Web Leads and
11 MediaAlpha? You know, other -- other
12 generators that -- other lead generators that
13 Lighthouse may use, you know, would be
14 different than those two.

15 So has Defendant called at least 40
16 other persons whose lead came through All Web
17 Leads and MediaAlpha using the same equipment
18 with which Defendant made the calls to the
19 Plaintiffs?

20 A. Again, we would buy a lead from All
21 Web or MediaAlpha with consent and dial those
22 leads to -- to inform them about the insurance
23 products that are available for -- for those
24 individuals.

25 Q. Okay. Let me try to ask this as

1 simply as I can.

2 Did Lighthouse purchase more than
3 40 leads from All Web Leads and MediaAlpha?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Do you know how many?

6 A. I do not know.

7 Q. Ballpark? I mean, is it 100?
8 1,000? 10,000?

9 A. Over what period of time?

10 Q. So four years starting from the
11 date this Complaint was filed. So we're
12 starting 2016, let's say. 2016 through the
13 present.

14 A. Yeah, it would be thousands.

15 Q. Okay. Understood. Okay.

16 A. I don't know the exact number, but
17 it would be a lot.

18 Q. Okay. Understood. More than 40,
19 very safe to say, it sounds like.

20 Okay. And kind of along this same
21 topic, and kind of bleeds into Request to Admit
22 No. 8, but does Lighthouse have the ability to
23 identify those folks? People whose leads were
24 purchased from All Web Leads and/or MediaAlpha
25 who were then called using the same dialer that

1 was used to call my clients?

2 A. We would be able -- if we had the
3 number -- if you were to give us the number, we
4 would be able to look that person up in our
5 system to pull the records of when that person
6 was dialed from our system.

7 Q. Do you have a way of isolating
8 which persons were part of an All Web Leads
9 lead purchase?

10 A. We would have to go back to All Web
11 and request the leads that we purchased.

12 Q. Okay. And the same is true of
13 MediaAlpha?

14 A. Correct.

15 Q. Is there any -- and we talked about
16 the lead ID numbers before, which were assigned
17 to the individual telephone numbers, leads,
18 that are purchased.

19 Is there any similar number that
20 would be assigned to the lead generator where
21 maybe you'd have a unique number unique to All
22 Web Leads, and every lead in the system that
23 came from All Web Leads would have that number
24 associated with it?

25 A. Yes. There's a lead ID for the

1 lead vendors.

2 Q. Okay. So, you know, if you
3 purchased a lead from All Web Leads for John
4 Smith, and you went into the dialer and found
5 John Smith, his lead would have All Web Leads'
6 ID number attached to it?

7 A. If you gave us John Smith to go and
8 look up in our system, yes, we would be able to
9 see the lead vendor that it came from.

10 Q. But there's no way to do that in
11 reverse, where you just are trying to find
12 every person John Smith and Sue Jones who came
13 from All Web Leads?

14 A. It would be very time consuming to
15 pull a list. I would -- it would be easier to
16 go back to the lead vendor to have them send us
17 the file.

18 Q. That you purchased. Okay.

19 A. Correct.

20 Q. Okay. So I understand you could do
21 that. You could go back and ask them.

22 If you had to do it internally -- I
23 don't know -- for whatever reason, All Web
24 Leads is just not answering your calls --

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. -- I get that it would be time
2 consuming, but how would you do it?

3 A. We would have to go into our system
4 and pull a lead list, which would be time
5 consuming.

6 Q. What do you mean by pulling a lead
7 list?

8 A. We would have to go -- the lead ID
9 for that vendor, we would have to pull. We
10 could then see all of the leads that we
11 purchased from them, but it would not give us
12 any information on when we dialed or how we
13 dialed that lead.

14 Q. Okay. When you say "how we dialed
15 that lead," are there different ways of
16 dialing?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. What are those?

19 A. Using the predictive dialer, which
20 dials, and then our agents, if it is in that
21 pipeline, meaning they have talked to that
22 person in the past, they would pull that person
23 up in their system to call back.

24 Q. Got it. Okay.

25 So sort of the predictive dialer is

1 used, you know, when you're trying to reach
2 someone for the first time, but --

3 A. Correct.

4 Q. -- then once there's, you know,
5 contact that's been made and your agents are
6 following up, that's more of a targeted
7 call-back?

8 A. Correct.

9 Q. Okay. So you would be able to --
10 once you pulled up this list of leads
11 associated with the lead generator's ID number,
12 right, you're saying that wouldn't
13 automatically tell you when that person was
14 called, or so you'd have to go through and
15 figure out if it's, you know, within X number
16 of years, and then of those, how many of those
17 calls were made using the predictive dialer
18 versus --

19 A. We would have to do that manually
20 to be able to see when that person was called
21 and how they were called.

22 Q. Okay. But if you would skip those
23 steps, would you be able to essentially just
24 download the list? Understanding that some of
25 them may be from, you know, eight years ago and

1 some of them maybe weren't called using the
2 predictive dialer, but would you just be able
3 to get the master list?

4 A. No. It would not be that easy. We
5 don't dial any number after 90 days or after
6 the call count gets to a certain number. So we
7 do not store those lists for more than a
8 certain period of time.

9 Q. Okay. So, really, the -- so after
10 90 days -- let's say you buy a batch of leads
11 today from All Web Leads, 91 days from now that
12 lead, if it didn't go anywhere, is going to be
13 deleted --

14 A. It's killed.

15 Q. -- from the system?

16 A. It's killed.

17 Q. Which means removed from the
18 system?

19 A. It may stay in the system for a
20 longer period of time. It is never dialed
21 again. However, the list, though we migrate
22 over to another database, it's killed. It's
23 pulled out of the telephony.

24 Q. Okay. So do you have access to
25 that other database where the killed leads are

1 moved to?

2 A. I -- I would have to look into
3 that. I don't know.

4 Q. Okay. The bottom line is that the
5 easiest thing would be for you to just ask All
6 Web Leads to give you the list that you
7 purchased again?

8 A. Correct.

9 Q. Okay. All right. Request No. 9
10 says, "Some of the calls You placed to one or
11 both Plaintiffs featured an artificial or
12 pre-recorded voice."

13 And the response is simply, "Deny."

14 Does Lighthouse use pre-recorded
15 voice technology at all?

16 A. No.

17 Q. Okay. And I just want to make sure
18 we're on the same page --

19 A. I guess, can you elaborate on that?

20 Q. Right. So I'm going to -- okay.

21 So --

22 MR. CONGENI: Yeah. I would just
23 lodge an objection to that, the last question.
24 But go ahead. Sorry.

25 Q. Okay. So it's just a flat "deny,"